P-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

E-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

# The Effect of On Time Performace on Ticket Buying Interest by Garuda Indonesia Airline Consumers at Komodo Airport

## Zenita Kurniasari<sup>1</sup> Regy Tofanni Amarda<sup>2</sup>

Air Transportation Management, Yogyakarta College of Aerospace Technology, Bantul Regency, DIY Province, Indonesia<sup>1,2</sup>

Email: zoeenita@gmail.com1 regiitofanni2011@gmail.com2

#### **Abstract**

Rivalry between airline companies makes airlines compete to provide the best service for every customer. One of the factors to increase buying interest is timeliness or On Time Performance (OTP). OTP is a consideration for consumers in choosing an airline. This study aims to determine how much influence On Time Performance (OTP) has on the interest in buying Garuda Indonesia airline tickets at Komodo Airport. The method used in this study is a quantitative method. The data sources in this study are Garuda Indonesia airline consumers who pass through Komodo Labuan Bajo Airport in the period from June 2021 to December 2021. The data collection technique in this study uses a questionnaire technique distributed online. The number of respondents in this study were 100 respondents. The results of the study indicate that the On Time Performance (OTP) variable partially has a significant influence on the Consumer Ticket Purchase Interest of Garuda Indonesia Airlines at Komodo Airport Labuan Bajo in the period June 2021 to December 2021. The effect of On Time Performance (OTP) on buying interest Garuda Indonesia airline tickets at Komodo Airport amounted to 38.3% and the remaining 62.7% was explained by other variables not discussed in this study such as ticket prices, services, route availability, aircraft types and others.

**Keywords**: On Time Performance (OTP), Interest To Buy, Garuda Indonesia



This work is licensed under a <u>Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License.</u>

## **INTRODUCTION**

Transportation is an element that is needed by almost all aspects of people's lives, one of which is air transportation. Airplanes always experience progress and breakthroughs with the changing times, of course, progress can be marked by the creation of many types of aircraft that provide advanced technology both in features, systems, and the most crucial thing is safety and comfort. This is certainly one of the causes of the enthusiasm of all levels of society to use air transportation facilities so as to also create rivalries between airline companies managed by State-Owned Enterprises (BUMN) and private parties in the aviation industry. The airline company must pay attention to the quality and quality of service in accordance with the standards set by the International Air Transport Association (IATA), including the level of safety and punctuality in flight (Duari 2018). To provide service, comfort, safety and increase buying interest, punctuality of departure time and arrival time in accordance with the predetermined flight schedule or called On Time Performace (OTP) is one of the important factors for the realization of this goal.

On the report from the official website (Garuda Indonesia 2021) About Garuda Indonesia, Garuda Indonesia airline was ranked 5-Star On Time Perfomance Rating 2020 from OAG Flightview which is an On Time Perfomance Independent rating agency based in the UK. This can be one of the races for air transportation service passengers to choose Garuda Indonesia as a trusted airline. In accordance with the background explanation in the previous sub-chapter, the formulation of the problem is compiled as follows:

P-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

E-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

- 1. Is There Any Effect of On Time Performace (OTP) on The Interest in Buying Tickets by Garuda Indonesia Airline Consumers at Komodo Airport?
- 2. How Much Effect Does On Time Performace (OTP) Have On The Interest In Buying Tickets By Garuda Indonesia Airline Consumers At Komodo Airport?

# Literature Review Buying Interest

According to (Buchari 2016) states that buying interest is how likely consumers are to buy a brand and service or how likely consumers are to move from one brand to another. If the benefits outweigh the sacrifices to get them then the urge to buy is higher. The buying interest gives rise to a motivation that will continue to be stored in the mind and become a strong desire that finally when they are going to meet their needs, they will realize what is in their minds. If a person has a high motivation towards a certain object, then he will be encouraged to behave mastering the product. On the contrary, if the motivation is low, as for the dimensions of buying interest according to (Raheni 2018) be:

- 1. Transactional Interests. Transactional Interest is the tendency of a person to refer a product to others.
- 2. Referral Interest. It is the interest of a person who has the main preference for the product.
- 3. Preferential Interests. It is the interest of a person who always has a primary preference for the products he has consumed, this preference can only be replaced when something happens with his reference product.
- 4. Exploratory Interests. Is the interest of a person who is always looking for information about the product he is interested in and looking for information to support the positive properties of the product

#### On Time Performance

On Time Performace (OTP) is a condition when the departure time and arrival time of the aircraft are in accordance with the stipulated (Girasyitia and Santosa 2015). Flight schedules that experience delays result in not achieving On Time Performace (OTP) and will cause a series of delay problems in the next flight schedule. This not only affects passengers, airline companies and airports are also affected. On Time Performace (OTP) not being reached can cause flight delays. Ministerial Regulation No. 89 of 2015 concerning Handling of Flight Delays (Delay Management) in Scheduled Commercial Air Transport Business Entities in Indonesia (Kemenhub 2015) explains about the factors causing flight delays, including:

- 1. Airline Management Factors. Is a factor caused by airlines.
- 2. Operational Technical Factors. Is a factor caused by the condition of the airport either in terms of facilities or the status of the airport itself.
- 3. Weather Factors. Is the Factor of rain, strong wind and lightning.
- 4. Miscellaneous Factors. Is a factor caused by riots or demonstrations in the airport area.

Ground handling time (Ground Time) is the standard service time provided when handling aircraft. For Narrow Body aircraft, the standard ground time is 40 minutes, while for Wide Body aircraft, the ground time standard is 60 minutes (Putra 2020).

#### **History of Garuda Indonesia**

On December 21, 1949, further negotiations were held on the results of the KMB between the Indonesian government and KLM (Koninklijke Luchtvaart Maatschappij- Inter-Insulair Bedrijf) regarding the establishment of a national airline. President Sukarno chose

P-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

E-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

and decided on "Garuda Indonesian Airways" (GIA) as the name of this airline. A year later, in 1950, Garuda Indonesia became a state company. In that period, Garuda Indonesia operated a fleet of 38 aircraft consisting of 22 DC-3s, 8 Catalina flying boats, and 8 Convair 240. Garuda Indonesia's fleet continued to grow and finally managed to carry out the first flight to Mecca carrying pilgrims from Indonesia in 1956. In 1965, the first flight to countries in Europe was made with Amsterdam as the last destination. Garuda Indonesia currently serves more than 60 destinations around the world and various exotic locations As the nation's flag carrier and in order to provide the best full service flight service,

#### **RESEARCH METHODS**

## **Research Design**

This research uses a quantitative research method approach, Quantitative approach is a researcher's effort to collect data in the nature of numbers, the data of these numbers is then processed using statistical work formulas and derived from variables that have been operationalized, with certain measuring scales such as nominal scales, ordinals, intervals, and ratios(Indrawan and Yaniawati 2016). In this study using associative quantitative research types. Because the data obtained from the numbers aims to determine the influence or also the relationship between the On Time Performace (X) variable and the Buying Interest variable (Y) and the measurement scale used is the likert scale.

## **Sempel Retrieval**

The population in this study were users of air transportation services who had purchased flight tickets from Garuda Indonesia Airlines. This study used a Non Probability Sampling Technique. Non probability sampling is a sampling technique that does not provide equal opportunities or opportunities for each element or member of the population to be selected into a sample (Sugiyono 2016). One technique in non probability sampling is purposive sampling. Purposive sampling is a sample determination technique with certain considerations (Sugiyono 2013). With the criteria for respondents determined by the examiner, the respondent was 17 years old and above. The selection of age 17 years and above is based on considerations of maturity age and is considered to be able to make your own decisions and has purchased Garuda Indonesia airline tickets within the last 6 months.

#### **Data Collection Techniques**

A questionnaire is a pre-compiled list of written questions, giving respondents the opportunity to answer behind closed doors. The dissemination of questionnaires can be done in several ways such as personal submission of questionnaires. This method has advantages, such as a questionnaire submitted personally can build relationships and motivation of respondents, it is cheaper if the administration is done directly in a group, the response is quite high (Sugiyono 2013). This study uses a measurement scale, namely the likert scale, the likert scale is a scale used to measure the opinions, attitudes and perceptions of a person or group of people about social phenomena (Sugiyono, 2013).

## RESULTS OF RESEARCH AND DISCUSSION Research Results Validity test

The validity test is carried out by correlating between the construct score and the total score. The method of taking the validity test 30 is if the significant value >0.05, then it is declared invalid (Doddy, 2012).

P-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

E-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

Table 1. Variebel Validity Test X (OTP) Results

| Question | Variable X  | R Table | R Calculate | Information |
|----------|-------------|---------|-------------|-------------|
| X1       |             | 0,374   | 0,604       | Valid       |
| X2       |             | 0,374   | 0,622       | Valid       |
| Х3       |             | 0,374   | 0,685       | Valid       |
| X4       |             | 0,374   | 0,807       | Valid       |
| X5       |             | 0,374   | 0,543       | Valid       |
| Х6       |             | 0,374   | 0,678       | Valid       |
| X7       | On Time     | 0,374   | 0,720       | Valid       |
| X8       | Performance | 0,374   | 0,778       | Valid       |
| Х9       |             | 0,374   | 0,784       | Valid       |
| X10      |             | 0,374   | 0,642       | Valid       |
| X11      |             | 0,374   | 0,552       | Valid       |
| X12      |             | 0,374   | 0,700       | Valid       |
| X13      |             | 0,374   | 0,653       | Valid       |
| X14      |             | 0,374   | 0,572       | Valid       |

Data source: SPSS processing

Validity Test Results from the On Time Performance variable in this study were higher than  $0.05\,$ 

**Table 2. Validity Test Results Variebel Y Buying Interest** 

| Question | Variable X | R Table | R Calculate | Information |
|----------|------------|---------|-------------|-------------|
| Y1       |            | 0,374   | 0,685       | Valid       |
| Y2       |            | 0,374   | 0,531       | Valid       |
| Y3       |            | 0,374   | 0,601       | Valid       |
| Y4       | Buying     | 0,374   | 0,836       | Valid       |
| Y5       | Interest   | 0,374   | 0,786       | Valid       |
| Y6       |            | 0,374   | 0,718       | Valid       |
| Y7       |            | 0,374   | 0,702       | Valid       |
| Y8       |            | 0,374   | 0,817       | Valid       |

Data source: SPSS processing

Validity Test Results of varied Buying Interest in this study were higher than 0.05.

#### **Reliability Test**

Reliability tests are performed to see if the instrument can measure a person consistently over time. If the results given are consistent, then it can be said to be reliable. Reliability is measured using the cronbach alpha method. The questionnaire can be said to be reliable if the value of cronbach alpha is greater than 0.60 (Priyatno 2016).

Table 3. Variable Reliability Test X (OTP) Results

| Reliability Statistics      |    |  |  |  |
|-----------------------------|----|--|--|--|
| Cronbach's Alpha N of Items |    |  |  |  |
| .899                        | 14 |  |  |  |

Data source: SPSS processing

Sourced in the table above, it can be concluded through the cronbach alpha value of the on time performance variable question item of 0.899>0.60 that the variable On Time Performance can be said to be reliable

| Table 4. Reliability Test Results Variebel | <b>Y</b> ( | Buving II | nterest) |
|--|------------|-----------|----------|
|--|------------|-----------|----------|

Reliability Statistics

P-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

E-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

| Cronbach's Alpha | N of Items |
|------------------|------------|
| .858             | 8          |

Data source: SPSS processing

Sourced in the table above, it can be concluded through the cronbach alpha value of the Purchase Interest variable question item of 0.858>0.60 that the purchase interest variable can be said to be reliable.

#### **Discussion**

To find out whether or not there is an influence between the variable X (On Time Performance) and the variable Y (Buying Interest), quantitative analysis is used using simple linear regression method calculations, determining coefficients and hypothesis tests. Where the data that becomes the calculation is obtained from a questionnaire distributed to users of Garuda Indonesia Airline flight services at Komodo Airport and processed by the author in the form of calculations.

## **Characteristics of Respondents**

This study aims to analyze the effect of On Time Performace (OTP) on Ticket Buying Interest by Garuda Indonesia Airline Consumers at Komodo Airport. Researchers distributed 100 questionnaires to Garuda Indonesia airline consumers online. The results of this study are related to the characteristics of the research sample, namely gender, age, occupation, whether or not they have used garuda indonesia airline services and how many times to use Garuda Indonesia airlines during the time span of June – December 2021.

Table 5. Respondent Data By Gender

| Tubic of Respondent Butta By defined |      |        |       |  |  |  |
|--------------------------------------|------|--------|-------|--|--|--|
| Gender                               | Male | Female | Total |  |  |  |
| Percentage                           | 53%  | 47%    | 100%  |  |  |  |

Sourced in the table above, it can be described as a sample of 53 men with a percentage of 43%. Furthermore, the female gender amounted to 47 people with a large percentage of 47%.

Table 6. Respondent Data By Age

| Age        | < 17 Year | > 17 Year | Total |
|------------|-----------|-----------|-------|
| Percentage | 0%        | 100%      | 100%  |

Sourced in the table above can be described a sample of more than 17 years old with a total of 100 people with a large percentage of 100%. Furthermore, the age of less than 17 years is 0 people with a large percentage of 0%.

Table 7. Respondent Data By Job

| Job        | private Employees | Civil Servants | Self Employed | Police/Army | Other | Total |
|------------|-------------------|----------------|---------------|-------------|-------|-------|
| Percentage | 29%               | 22%            | 27%           | 5%          | 17%   | 100%  |

Sourced in the table above, it can be described a sample that works as a Private Employee with a total of 29 people with a percentage of 29%. Next is to work as a civil servant with a total of 22 people with a large percentage of 22%. The number of respondents who work as entrepreneurs with a total of 27 people with a large percentage of 27%. The number of respondents who work as TNI / POLRI with a total of 5 people with a large percentage of

P-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

E-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

5%. The number of respondents who have other jobs with a total of 17 people with a large percentage of 17 %.

Table 8. Respondent Experience Data Using Garuda Indonesia Airline Services

| Experience | Not Yet | Already | Total |
|------------|---------|---------|-------|
| Percentage | 0%      | 100%    | 100%  |

Sourced in the table above, it can be described that the sample that has used the services of Garuda Indonesia airlines is 100 people with a large percentage of 100%. Furthermore, the sample who has never used the services of Garuda Indonesia airlines is 0 people with a large percentage of 0%.

Table 9. Based on the number of respondents using Garuda Indonesia airline services in the period June

- December 2021

| December 2021        |     |     |     |              |       |  |  |
|----------------------|-----|-----|-----|--------------|-------|--|--|
| Use Garuda Indonesia | 1x  | 2x  | 3x  | More Than 4x | Total |  |  |
| Percentage           | 28% | 39% | 18% | 15%          | 100%  |  |  |

Sourced in the table above, it can be described as many as 1x the sample that has used the services of Garuda Indonesia Airlines as much as 28%. The number of samples who have used the services of Garuda Indonesia Airlines as much as 2x amounted to 39%. %. The number of samples that have used the services of Garuda Indonesia Airlines as much as 3x amounts to 18%. %. The number of samples that have used the services of Garuda Indonesia airlines is more than 4x amounting to 15%.

## **Linear Regression Test**

**Table 10. Simple Linear Regression Test Results** 

| ANOVA <sup>a</sup>                |  |              |            |           |        |       |  |
|-----------------------------------|--|--------------|------------|-----------|--------|-------|--|
|                                   | Model Sum of Squares df Mean Square F Sig. |              |            |           |        |       |  |
|                                   | Regression                                 | 300.992      | 1          | 300.992   | 62.382 | .000b |  |
| 1                                 | Residual                                   | 472.848      | 98         | 4.825     |        |       |  |
|                                   | Total                                      | 773.840      | 99         |           |        |       |  |
| a. Dependent Variable: Minat Beli |  |              |            |           |        |       |  |
|                                   |  | b. Predictor | s: (Consta | ant), OTP |        |       |  |

Data source: SPSS processing

In the results of a simple linear regression test in the table above the Significance value is 0.000. This value < 0.05, then the H1 hypothesis is accepted which means that there is a significant influence between On Time Performance (OTP) or Punctuality on Ticket Buying Interest by Garuda Indonesia Airline Consumers. To find out how much influence independent variables have on the variables, an effective contribution test of the variables is carried out.

**Table 11. Table Test Results** 

| Model Summary                  |       |          |                      |                            |  |  |
|--------------------------------|-------|----------|----------------------|----------------------------|--|--|
| Model                          | R     | R Square | Adjusted R<br>Square | Std. Error of the Estimate |  |  |
| 1                              | .624a | .389     | .383                 | 2.197                      |  |  |
| a. Predictors: (Constant), OTP |       |          |                      |                            |  |  |

Data source: SPSS processing

Sourced in the table above R Square shows the value of 0.389. This proves that On Time Performance (OTP) contributes up to 38.9% to the Interest in Buying Tickets by Garuda Indonesia Airline Consumers. The next step is to determine the regression formula to

P-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

E-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

calculate the affectability between variable X and variable Y. In general, the regression formula is: Y = a + Bx. Y is a dependent variable, in this case it is the Interest in Buying Tickets by Garuda Indonesia Airline Consumers, and X is an independent variable, in this case it is On Time Performance (OTP). Whereas A and A are the values of the sought-after constants.

**Table 12. Constant Test Results** 

| Coefficients <sup>a</sup>         |            |                             |            |                           |        |      |  |  |
|-----------------------------------|------------|-----------------------------|------------|---------------------------|--------|------|--|--|
| Model                             |            | Unstandardized Coefficients |            | Standardized Coefficients | +      | Cia  |  |  |
|                                   |            | В                           | Std. Error | Beta                      | t Sig. |      |  |  |
| 1                                 | (Constant) | 10.707                      | 3.079      |                           | 3.478  | .001 |  |  |
| 1                                 | OTP        | .393                        | .050       | .624                      | 7.898  | .000 |  |  |
| a. Dependent Variable: Minat Beli |            |                             |            |                           |        |      |  |  |

Data source: SPSS processing

Sourced in the table above, it is known that the constant value is 10,707 and the OTP value is 0.393. From this information, the regression equation can be obtained as follows: Y = 10.707 + 0.393X. Or in other words, Interest in Buying Tickets By Consumers = 10.707 + 0.393 On Time Performance (OTP). The constant of 10.707 states that any increase in On Time Performance (X) will be followed by an increase in Consumer Buying Interest (Y) of 0.393. Vice versa, If On Time Performance (X) decreases by 0.393 then the distribution decreases by 0.393 at the value of the coefficiency of the constant a or the constant of 8.457.

**Table 13. T Test Results** 

| Coefficients <sup>a</sup>         |            |                             |            |                           |        |      |  |  |  |
|-----------------------------------|------------|-----------------------------|------------|---------------------------|--------|------|--|--|--|
| Model                             |            | Unstandardized Coefficients |            | Standardized Coefficients |        | C:~  |  |  |  |
|                                   |            | В                           | Std. Error | Beta                      | t Sig. |      |  |  |  |
| 1                                 | (Constant) | 10.707                      | 3.079      |                           | 3.478  | .001 |  |  |  |
| 1                                 | OTP        | .393                        | .050       | .624                      | 7.898  | .000 |  |  |  |
| a. Dependent Variable: Minat Beli |            |                             |            |                           |        |      |  |  |  |

Data source: SPSS processing

Sourced in the table above by observing rows, columns t and sig, it can be explained as follows: The Effect of On Time Performace on Ticket Buying Interest by Garuda Indonesia Airline Consumers at Komodo Airport (H1). Variebel On Time Performance (X) has a positive and significant effect On Time Performance (X) 0.00 < 0.05 and the value of Ttabel = t (a/2; n-1 = t (0.025;99) = 1.98422 . Means the value of t count is greater than t table (7.896 > 1.98422) then H1 is accepted. So that the hypothesis that can be determined is that there is an Effect of On Time Performace on The Interest in Buying Tickets by Garuda Indonesia Airline Consumers at Komodo Airport is partially accepted.

Table 14. Coefficient of Determination Test Results

| Model Summary                  |       |          |                   |                            |  |  |  |  |  |
|--------------------------------|-------|----------|-------------------|----------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|
| Model                          | R     | R Square | Adjusted R Square | Std. Error of the Estimate |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1                              | .624a | .389     | .383              | 2.197                      |  |  |  |  |  |
| a. Predictors: (Constant), OTP |       |          |                   |                            |  |  |  |  |  |

Data source: SPSS processing

Sourced in the table above, it can be seen that the coefesion value of determination is found in the Adjusted R Square value of 0.383. This means that the ability of free variables in explaining bound variables is 38.3% the remaining 62.7% is explained by other variables that were not discussed in this study.

P-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

E-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

#### **CONCLUSION**

Based on the discussion above, it can be concluded that On Time Performance (OTP) partially has a significant influence on the increasing Interest in Buying Garuda Indonesia Airline Consumer Tickets at Komodo Labuan Bajo Airport in the period from June 2021 to December 2021. The effect of the On Time Performance (X) variable on Repurchase Interest (Y) was 38.3% and the remaining 62.7% was a component of various factors, namely service, baggage, check-in counters, facilities, experience, as well as ticket prices, services, route availability, aircraft type and others. In some of the researcher's interview questions to respondents, the researcher summarized the respondents' answers as follows: On Time Performance is important for buying garuda indonesia airline ticket services, As for the respondents' advice, respondents' suggestions are that respondents hope that garuda indonesia airlines can maintain on time performance services to maintain passenger confidence as the most punctual airline among other airlines.

Advice for the Company: The results of this study are expected to be a source of information and be used as material for evaluation and strategy of Garuda Indonesia Airlines to continue to maintain and improve the On Time Performance (OTP) of Garuda Indonesia Airlines, because the 38.3% increase in On Time Performance (OTP) affects the Interest in Buying Tickets by Garuda Indonesia Airline Consumers. For Academics: This research report is expected to add knowledge and insight into the impact of On Time Performance (OTP) on the interest in buying tickets by consumers in the aviation world. For The Next Researcher: For research on On Time Performance, it can then be focused on efforts to improve On Time Performance so that it can find out how Airlines can improve On Time Performance. As for research on buying interest, you can look for new variables other than OTP that can affect buying interest such as; Airport facilities, ticket prices, marketing, miles, and Carier.

#### **BIBLIOGRAPHY**

Buchari, Alma, and Kotler dan Keller. 2016. Dasar-Dasar Pemasaran. Jilid 4.Ed. ed. Alih Bahasa: Buchari Alma. Jakarta: PT. Indeks Gramedia.

Duari, I Putu Hardani Hesti. 2018. Tiket Penerbangan Domestik. Deepublish.

Garuda Indonesia. 2021. "Data Operasional Bulanan - Garuda Indonesia." Official Web. https://www.garuda-indonesia.com/id/id/investor-relations/company-data/monthly-operating-data/index (December 29, 2021).

Girasyitia, Ganayu, and Wimpy Santosa. 2015. "Evaluasi On Time Performance Pesawat Udara Di Bandar Udara Husein Sastranegara Menggunakan Aplikasi Flightradar24." Jurnal Transportasi 15(2): 143–50.

http://journal.unpar.ac.id/index.php/journaltransportasi/article/view/1732.

Indrawan, Rully, and R Poppy Yaniawati. 2016. "Metodologi Penelitian: Kuantitatif, Kualitatif Dan Campuran Untuk Manajemen, Pembangunan, Dan Pendidikan."

Kemenhub. 2015. "Penanganan Keterlambatan Penerbangan (Delay Management) Pada Badan Usaha Angkutan Udara Niaga Berjadwal Di Indonesia." (PM 89): 1–20.

Mestina Putra, Danil. 2020. "Analisis Ground Time Tipe Pesawat Boeing 737-800 Dan Airbus A320 Guna Mendukung On Time Performance Pesawat Pada Pt. Gapura Angkasa Bandar Udara Internasional Minangkabau." SEKOLAH TINGGI TEKNOLOGI ADISUTJIPTO YOGYAKARTA.

Priyatno, Duwi. 2016. "Belajar Alat Analisis Data Dan Cara Pengolahannya Dengan SPSS." Yogyakarta: Gava Media.

Raheni, Cahyaning. 2018. "Pengaruh Media Sosial Terhadap Minat Beli Konsumen Studi Kasus

P-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

E-ISSN: xxxx-xxxx

Mahasiswa." Jurnal Sinar Manajemen 5(2): 82–85.

Sugiyono. 2013. "Metode Penelitian Pendidikan Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif Dan R&D." Sugiyono, S. 2016. "Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif Dan Kombinasi (Mixed Methods) (M. Sutopo, Ed.)." Bandung: ALFABETA. cv.